

APPENDIX B

To receive an updated report on the Jubilee Pontoon and consider any actions and associated expenditure.

Report to: Services Committee

Date of Report: 02.04.25

Officer Writing the Report: Town Clerk

Pursuant to: Services Committee 13.02.25 minute 106/24/25

Officers Recommendations

1. To receive and note Voyager Marine's report for completion of phase 1 works at a net cost of £24,950 (Appendix A).
2. To receive and consider Voyager Marine's quote to undertake the storm damage work at a net cost of £24,990.71 (Appendix B), insurers settlement offers £13,913.13 towards total net cost, Saltash Town Council balance of £11,077.58.
3. To receive and note Primrose Marine Survey Report on the pontoon and piles (Appendix C and D).
4. To consider Voyager Marine's quote to undertake maintenance work to the pontoon and piles and relaunch back in the Tamar (Appendix E, F and G).
5. To note that the insurers have confirmed they are prepared to make a 50% contribution towards the cost of lifting and re-installing the pontoon, in line with the apportionment between storm damage and maintenance.
6. To note; Voyager Marine will do their utmost to avoid the descaling of the five piles in the river Tamar. However, this is not guaranteed. The tide will predict the work and will create noise pollution.

Report Summary

Prior to commencement of the phase 1 work, Cornwall Council were informed and provided their approval for their pontoon to be removed to Voyager Marine for the necessary repairs to be undertaken. The King's Harbour Master was also informed, no response received.

Phase 1 work is now completed – for further information, refer to Appendix A summary of work completed by Voyager Marine. Works have been undertaken in line with the approved quote.

During phase 1 the insurers Marine Surveyor (Crispin Marine) attended site to review the damage to the pontoon to assist with their recommended report – refer further into the report to review Crispin Marine's recommendation to Axis.

Part of the phase 1 work included a visit from Primrose Marine to produce a pontoon survey and piles report (appointed by Voyager Marine) – refer to Appendix C and D for further information. The reports provide an overview of the damage / repair work / maintenance to the pontoon / piles and recommendations thereof together with associated cost from Voyager Marine – Appendix E, F and G for consideration.

The pontoon remains at Voyager Marine until the Town Council confirms if it wishes to proceed with the remaining work to relaunch the pontoon back in the Tamar. The insurers have offered their final settlement against the cost relating to Appendix B, the outstanding amount is an amount the Town Council would need to cover together with the associated cost relating to Appendix E, F and G. This would be an investment from Saltash Town Council to repair and maintain the pontoon to become operational.

Providing the Primrose Marine recommendations are carried out the pontoon system will be protected and in very good order. Annual maintenance will be required to include spot touch up painting of any scuffs and damage to the paint system, every 2 years tightening and replacing nuts and bolts and anodes. All works can be carried out in the water. Pontoon system to be removed and refurbed in 10 years providing Primrose recommendations and annual maintenance is carried out.

Pictures and a video of a large boat bashing against the pontoon has been shared with the Adjuster Woodgate and Clark together with an email from Cornwall Council's Maritime Manager at the time, dated September 2018, regarding maintenance levels:

I don't know of any pontoon system that is required to be lifted out and inspected on an annual basis. When this was originally installed, Caradon DC were informed that it would have to come out after 15 years. I think that the insurance company may be getting confused with regard to swinging moorings which are a totally different matter. As long as Saltash Town Council have recorded visual inspections and repair any damage then I would not have thought that it needed to be lifted out for at least ten years – Cornwall Council Maritime Manager.

Woodgate and Clark have confirmed receipt of the documents shared and that the content has been duly noted and will be shared with Axis (insurance company) and Crispin Marine.

Woodgate and Clark also confirm that Voyager Marine's quote for the storm damage repairs only, and Crispin Marine's report have been received and sent to Axis for instructions. We now await Axis decision to Saltash Town Council's claim.

Correspondence from Axis:

I refer to my previous message below and am pleased to confirm that we have now received insurers further instructions and are in a position to put forward a settlement offer in respect of the necessary repairs to the pontoon resulting from the storm.

As you know, Pete Crispin was provided with a revised estimate on 27th March, which he has broken down as follows:

£ 2,513.36: Steel and framework as listed. Reasonable.

£ 672.00: Fastenings. Not all are relevant to the incident. Suggest a 50/50 split.

£ 347.18: Consumables. Reasonable.

£ 1,033.17: Decking and rubbing boards. Not all are relevant to the incident. Suggest a 50/50 split.

£ 6,700.00: Acid dipping and galvanising. Reasonable.

£ 13,725.00: Labour based on 305 hours at £45 per hour. Excessive. See below.

£ 24,990.71: Sub-total

£ 4,998.14: VAT

£ 29,988.85: TOTAL

Comments on labour - In my opinion, the labour to carry out the repairs only is estimated at 5 days for 2 men, including removal and refitting. At an 8-hour day, this is 80 hours. The labour rate has increased from the first estimate but £35 per hour was cheap and £45 is reasonable, so there is no issue with that. This means that the reasonable labour cost to repair the and refit the damaged framework is £3,600. If a contingency is allowed, £4,000 is reasonable.

The hours for the scope of works were checked with another shipyard that I work with regularly and they agreed with the suggested figures.

This means that with the adjustments suggested above, the reasonable cost of repair is:

£ 2,513.36: Steel and framework as listed.

£ 336.00: Fastenings.

£ 347.18: Consumables. Reasonable.

£ 516.59: Decking and rubbing boards.

£ 6,700.00: Acid dipping and galvanising.

£ 4,000.00: Labour

£ 14,413.13: TOTAL excl. VAT

*The policy is subject to an excess of £500 and net of this, insurers would be prepared to put forward a **settlement offer of £13,913.13** in respect of the repairs resulting from the storm.*

With regards to the points raised in your email of 31st March 2025, it appears you are suggesting that there may be some recourse against the owner of the yacht that was moored against the pontoon. We have discussed this with Pete Crispin, but he is of the opinion that this is unlikely to have caused any damage. In addition, we would need to demonstrate negligence on the part of the vessel owner which would be very difficult given the prevalent weather conditions.

With regards to the suggested maintenance of the pontoon, it appears there has been some misunderstanding, in that Pete did not state that the pontoon would have to be lifted from the water on an annual basis, but more likely every 5 years.

Upon receipt of confirmation that insurers' offer is acceptable, together with details of the bank account that the funds should be transferred into, we will be pleased to make the necessary arrangements.

Their settlement offer has been acknowledged, and a question raised as to why the associated cost for lifting out and back in the water have not been included in their settlement offer – this has now been rectified, refer to point 5 above.

Voyager Marine have confirmed the 305 hours is made up of not only fixing the 2X damaged subframes but also travel and loading time (including use of their lorry) for 2X persons to take the frames to Crediton for galvanise stripping, then up again to bring them back, once repairs are completed they need to go to Crediton to be collected, so 4X runs to Crediton. (this was Crispin Marine's idea to get them stripped back in this way).

Also, time for fitting the dozen missing deck boards and covering strips, fitting the new timber rubbing protection, fitting the new subframes to the pontoon floats, they will need some leverage as no doubt the holes won't be perfectly aligned.

Voyager Marine are concerned by Crispin Marine's advice relating to labour because in reality these things do take time.

Voyager Marine invite Members to attend the Boatyard to see exactly what the pontoon system is like and what they are dealing with.

I asked Voyager Marine how much a pontoon like Jubilee is worth. They referred to the second-hand market costing approximately £500,000. They don't believe anyone builds pontoons like this and there is no-one filling the gap in the market since the administration of Docking Solutions.

Voyager Marine are aiming to have the pontoon up and running by w/c 19 May should the Town Council wish to proceed with the investment.

Report Images

Refer to Appendix A to view images of the pontoon at Voyager Marine.

How Does This Meet the Business Plan?

Boosting Jobs and Economic Prosperity.

Travel and Transport.

Recreation and Leisure.

The pontoon provides a successful ferry service for the residents of Saltash. Last year's data together with the Community Levelling Up Funded trial provides supportive results for Saltash Town Council to confidentially continue with the service for years to come.

Saltash Town Team are working hard to attract visitors to Saltash. The pontoon forms part of the production of a leaflet and visitors guide to build the attraction.

Quotes Provided

Refer to Appendix B, E, F and G for associated cost – potentially part funded by the insurers.

Total net cost for storm damage repairs, maintenance, taking out and reinstating in the Tamar: £134,120.21.

Total net cost paid by Saltash Town Council for phase 1 work: £24,950.

Insurers settlement offers: £13,913.13.

Outstanding net cost to Saltash Town Council for storm damage repairs, maintenance, reinstating pontoon in the Tamar: £95,257.08.

Budgets

Budget Codes: General Reserves (GR)

Budget Availability: £454,647 prior to adjustments back to GR from the year 2024-25

Financial Regulations

The Town Clerk sought advice from Parkinson Partnership about not advertising the pontoon work on Contracts Finder because of the urgency to appoint due to health and safety concerns. Parkinson Partnership confirmed:

If specific invitations are not normally council policy, but the council has agreed to the approach due to the urgency/safety issues, that is also fine.

Signature of Officer:

Town Clerk